

Example 1 – Virginia Tech CLE (Curriculum for General Education)¹

Virginia Tech has 7 areas of learning outcomes, including “Critique and Practice in Design and the Arts.”

These courses expect students to do the following:

1. Identify and apply formal elements of design or the arts.
2. Explain the historical context of design or the arts.
3. Apply interpretive strategies or methodologies in design or the arts.
4. Employ skills, tools, and methods of working in design or the arts.
5. Produce a fully developed work through iterative processes of design or the arts.

All students must take 6 hours in this area: 3 in design and 3 in arts or 6 in integrated arts and design.

Rubric for Critique & Practice in Design and Arts:

This rubric was created to assess student learning in Pathways courses and will evolve as the Pathways general education program is implemented.

CRITIQUE AND PRACTICE IN THE ARTS AND DESIGN

Learning Indicator	Below Competent	Competent	Above Competent
1. Identify and apply formal elements of design or the arts.	Attempts to identify the formal elements of design or the arts; explanations are unclear or inaccurate.	Adequately identifies the formal elements of design or the arts and applies rudimentary knowledge to the creative form under study.	Effectively summarizes the formal elements of design or the arts and applies this knowledge to the creative form under study.
2. Explain the historical context of design or the arts.	Presents limited or incorrect explanation and connectivity of historical context to the argument or purpose of the work.	Presents adequate explanation and connectivity of historical context to the argument or purpose of the work.	Proficiently and accurately explains and connects historical context to the argument or purpose of the work.
3. Apply interpretive strategies or methodologies in design or the arts.	Demonstrates limited ability to apply and utilize interpretive strategies or methodologies.	Demonstrates satisfactory ability to apply and utilize interpretive strategies or methodologies.	Proficiently/effectively demonstrates the ability to apply and utilize interpretive strategies or methodologies.

¹ Virginia Tech Pathways to General Education <https://www.pathways.prov.vt.edu/about/outcomes.html>

<p>4. Employ skills, tools, and methods of working in design or the arts.</p>	<p>Demonstrates limited knowledge and/or use of the skills, tools, and methods of working in the creative form under study.</p>	<p>Satisfactorily demonstrates knowledge and/or use of the skills, tools, and methods of working in the creative form under study.</p>	<p>Proficiently/effectively demonstrates knowledge and/or use of the skills, tools, and methods of working in the creative form under study.</p>
<p>5. Produce a fully developed work through iterative processes of design or the arts.</p>	<p>Demonstrates limited understanding of iterative processes of design or the arts; work produced is of sub-standard quality.</p>	<p>Demonstrates satisfactory understanding of iterative processes; work produced is of acceptable quality.</p>	<p>Demonstrates proficient understanding of iterative processes through the production of high quality, fully developed work.</p>

Example 2 – Miami Dade College²

Student learning outcome for arts: Demonstrate an appreciation for aesthetics and creative activities.

<p>MDC Learning Outcome</p>	<p>Emerging 1</p>	<p>Developing 2</p>	<p>Proficient 3</p>	<p>Exemplary 4</p>
<p>LO9 Aesthetic Appreciation (Revised 1/26/09)</p>	<p>Lacks recognition and interpretation of the creative expression in any of the works.</p> <p>Response is not analytical, and is missing concrete details, personal perceptions and personal associations about the work.</p>	<p>Has difficulty recognizing interpreting the creative expression in the works.</p> <p>Response is minimally analytical, and is supported with only one of the following: concrete details, personal perceptions or personal associations about the work.</p>	<p>Adequately recognizes and interprets the creative expression in more than one variety of work.</p> <p>Response is analytical, and is supported with two out of the following three: concrete details, personal perceptions and personal associations about the work.</p>	<p>Clearly recognizes and interprets the complexity and creative expression in a variety of works.</p> <p>Response is significantly analytical, and is supported with all of the following: concrete details, personal perceptions and personal associations about the work.</p>

² <https://www.mdc.edu/learningoutcomes/>

Examples 3 and 4

Both Indiana University and the University of Kentucky use two common student learning outcomes for their “cornerstone” courses that all students take (math, science, arts/humanities, social sciences).

Example 3 Student Learning Outcomes for “Humanistic and Artistic Ways of Knowing”³

- Access, use, and critically evaluate a variety of information sources.
- Apply principles of inquiry to define and analyze complex problems through reasoning and discovery.

Upon completion of inquiry in humanistic and artistic ways of knowing, students will be able to:

1. Recognize and describe humanistic, historical, or artistic works or problems and patterns of the human experience.
2. Apply disciplinary methodologies, epistemologies, and traditions of the humanities and the arts, including the ability to distinguish primary and secondary sources.
3. Analyze and evaluate texts, objects, events, or ideas in their cultural, intellectual or historical contexts.
4. Analyze the concepts and principles of various types of humanistic or artistic expression.
5. Create, interpret, or reinterpret artistic and/or humanistic works through performance or criticism.
6. Develop arguments about forms of human agency or expression grounded in rational analysis and in an understanding of and respect for spatial, temporal, and cultural contexts.
7. Analyze diverse narratives and evidence in order to explore the complexity of human experience across space and time.

Example 4 – Learning Outcome I: Intellectual Inquiry⁴

- Students will demonstrate an understanding of and ability to employ the processes of intellectual inquiry.

Rubric specific to Arts and Creativity:

³ Indiana University East. http://www.iue.edu/catalog/policies/documents/IU_East_General_Education_Curriculum_2017.pdf

⁴ University of Kentucky. <http://www.uky.edu/registrar/content/uk-core>

	4	3	2	1	0
Identify multiple dimensions of a good question <i>Define and distinguish approaches to creativity.</i>	Specifically identifies, defines and distinguishes an approach to creativity.	Specifically identifies, defines and distinguishes an approach to creativity in a limited way.	Specifically identifies an approach to creativity but does not define or distinguish it.	Acknowledges but does not specifically identify, define or distinguish an approach to creativity.	Does not acknowledge the concept of creativity.
Theses and conclusions <i>Demonstrates the application of logic, laws, constraints of the area of study and the evaluation and refinement of the results of own creative endeavors</i>	Critically evaluates the issues involved in addressing one's own work or implications of differing approaches; clearly articulates an argument and cites appropriate evidence; identifies the actual or potential impact of different approaches.	Articulates major issues involved in addressing one's own work or implications of differing approaches; constructs an argument and supports assertions with a range of evidence.	Identifies issues involved in addressing one's own work or implications of differing approaches; clearly states a position, and supports assertions with some evidence.	Refers to some reasons why evaluation of one's own work or the implications of differing approaches is important but does not support evaluation with evidence.	Does not recognize major issues involved in the evaluation of one's work or implications of differing approaches.

	4	3	2	1	0
Implications <i>Explore the implications of differing approaches, methodologies or conclusions.</i>	Clearly identifies one or more implications; clearly and fully articulates an argument and cites appropriate evidence.	Clearly identifies implications of the creative process or product; constructs an argument and supports assertions with a range of evidence.	Clearly identifies implications involved in the creative process or product and supports assertions with some evidence.	Refers to the existence of implications but does not identify them or support that evaluation with evidence.	Does not recognize major implications of the creative process or product.

<p>Develop potential solutions to problems based on sound evidence and reasoning <i>Engage actively in the creation of an object, installation, presentation, performance in a way that demonstrates an understanding of the creative process</i></p>	<p>Evidence of active engagement in creative process in an approach to solving a problem. The solution incorporates at least two of the following: demonstrates sophisticated skills and competency in a discipline or domain (may include novel materials, breaking established rules of practice, etc); employs ways of thinking that are new to the student; crosses boundaries in that it employs one or more approaches to create an insightful comparison; demonstrates thoughtful evaluation and revision.</p>	<p>Evidence of active engagement in creative process in an approach to solving a problem. The solution incorporates at least two of the following: demonstrates basic competency in a discipline or domain (materials, rules of practice, etc); applies ways of thinking that are new to the student; connects one or more ideas, approaches, or processes to create an insightful comparison.</p>	<p>Evidence of active engagement in creative process in an approach to solving a problem. The solution incorporates at least two of the following: applies basic skills in a discipline or domain (materials, rules of practice, etc); experiments with ways of thinking that are new to the student; acknowledges divergent approaches in a small way.</p>	<p>Evidence of active engagement in creative process in an approach to solving a problem. The solution incorporates at least one of the following: attempts basic skills in a discipline or domain (materials, rules of practice, etc); expresses an idea, concept, or format; acknowledges contradictions.</p>	<p>No evidence of active engagement in creative process.</p>
---	---	--	---	---	--

Example 5: Columbus State University⁵

Students are required to take one fine arts course, under the following student learning outcome:

Generate knowledgeable interpretations of texts, works of art, or music.

Rubric for assessment:

	Capstone 4	Milestones		Benchmark 1
		3	2	
Knowledge <i>Cultural self-awareness</i>	Articulates insights into own cultural rules and biases (e.g. seeking complexity; aware of how her/his experiences have shaped these rules, and how to recognize and respond to cultural biases, resulting in a shift in self-description.)	Recognizes new perspectives about own cultural rules and biases (e.g. not looking for sameness; comfortable with the complexities that new perspectives offer.)	Identifies own cultural rules and biases (e.g. with a strong preference for those rules shared with own cultural group and seeks the same in others.)	Shows minimal awareness of own cultural rules and biases (even those shared with own cultural group(s)) (e.g. uncomfortable with identifying possible cultural differences with others.)
Knowledge <i>Knowledge of cultural worldview frameworks</i>	Demonstrates sophisticated understanding of the complexity of elements important to members of another culture in relation to its history, values, politics, communication styles, economy, or beliefs and practices.	Demonstrates adequate understanding of the complexity of elements important to members of another culture in relation to its history, values, politics, communication styles, economy, or beliefs and practices.	Demonstrates partial understanding of the complexity of elements important to members of another culture in relation to its history, values, politics, communication styles, economy, or beliefs and practices.	Demonstrates surface understanding of the complexity of elements important to members of another culture in relation to its history, values, politics, communication styles, economy, or beliefs and practices.
Skills <i>Empathy</i>	Interprets intercultural experience from the perspectives of own and more than one worldview and demonstrates ability to act in a supportive manner that recognizes the feelings of another cultural group.	Recognizes intellectual and emotional dimensions of more than one worldview and sometimes uses more than one worldview in interactions.	Identifies components of other cultural perspectives but responds in all situations with own worldview.	Views the experience of others but does so through own cultural worldview.
Skills <i>Verbal and nonverbal communication</i>	Articulates a complex understanding of cultural differences in verbal and nonverbal communication (e.g., demonstrates understanding of the degree to which people use physical contact while communicating in different cultures or use direct/indirect and explicit/implicit meanings) and is able to skillfully negotiate a shared understanding based on those differences.	Recognizes and participates in cultural differences in verbal and nonverbal communication and begins to negotiate a shared understanding based on those differences.	Identifies some cultural differences in verbal and nonverbal communication and is aware that misunderstandings can occur based on those differences but is still unable to negotiate a shared understanding.	Has a minimal level of understanding of cultural differences in verbal and nonverbal communication; is unable to negotiate a shared understanding.
Attitudes <i>Curiosity</i>	Asks complex questions about other cultures, seeks out and articulates answers to these questions that reflect multiple cultural perspectives.	Asks deeper questions about other cultures and seeks out answers to these questions.	Asks simple or surface questions about other cultures.	States minimal interest in learning more about other cultures.
Attitudes <i>Openness</i>	Initiates and develops interactions with culturally different others. Suspends judgment in valuing her/his interactions with culturally different others.	Begins to initiate and develop interactions with culturally different others. Begins to suspend judgment in valuing her/his interactions with culturally different others.	Expresses openness to most, if not all, interactions with culturally different others. Has difficulty suspending any judgment in her/his interactions with culturally different others, and is aware of own judgment and expresses a willingness to change.	Receptive to interacting with culturally different others. Has difficulty suspending any judgment in her/his interactions with culturally different others, but is unaware of own judgment.

⁵ <https://academics.columbusstate.edu/catalogs/current/degreesandprograms/genedassess.php>

Example 6 – Revising Student Learning Outcomes⁶

“The 1997 Campus Learning Objectives were written by faculty, for faculty. The two examples below illustrate high aspirational goals with no clear path for attaining them within the university:

1. Educated persons should develop the skills to understand, accept, and relate to people of different backgrounds and beliefs. In a pluralistic world one should not be provincial or ignorant of other cultures; one’s life is experienced within the context of other races, religions, languages, nationalities, and value systems.
2. Educated persons should be expected to have some understanding of and experience in thinking about moral and ethical problems. A significant quality in educated persons is the ability to question and clarify personal and cultural values and thus be able to make discriminating moral and ethical choices.

The new Campus Learning Outcomes are written purposefully in a clear and concise language, which helps students understand expectations of them:

1. Communicate clearly and effectively in written and oral forms
2. Access, use, and critically evaluate a variety of relevant information sources
3. Apply principles of inquiry to define and analyze complex problems through reasoning and discovery
4. Demonstrate the ability to relate within a multicultural and digitally connected world
5. Demonstrate a deep understanding of a field of study

Each new outcome comes with an explanatory paragraph to provide clarity, which helps faculty members, students, and stakeholders better understand the intent of each outcome. It is clear that the new outcomes are simpler, streamlined, and easier to assess compared with the old objectives.”

⁶ Excerpts from Alexander, R., Blakefield, M., Frank, K., & Pomper, M. (2016). State Mandates and General Education: One Campus Responds to Challenges and Opportunities. *The Journal of General Education*, 65(1), 36–47.